

**Report Identification Number: NY-18-030** 

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

**Issue Date: Sep 28, 2018** 

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



## Abbreviations

Relationships							
BM-Biological Mother SM-Subject Mother SC-Subject Child							
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child					
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father					
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider					
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father					
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle					
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub					
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult						
	Contacts						
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner					
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services					
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother					
CPS-Child Protective Services							
	Allegations						
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts					
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding					
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse					
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect					
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive					
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision					
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other						
	Miscellaneous						
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender					
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence					
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police					
Service	Services Department						
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care					
Rehabilitative Services	Families						
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room COS-Court Ordered Service						
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan					
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment					
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old					
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation							



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Kings **Date of Death:** 03/30/2018

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 03/30/2018

#### **Presenting Information**

On 3/30/18, the SCR registered three reports that alleged DOA/Fatality and IG and II of the SC by the SM.

According to the reports, between 5:00 AM and 5:30 AM on 3/30/18, the BM fell asleep while the newborn SC was sleeping on the SM's chest after she fed the SC. During this time, the SM failed to place the SC in his crib while laying the SC on his back. At about 11:30 AM, the SM awoke and found the SC lying face down in the bed next to her. The SC was not breathing and unresponsive for an unknown period of time. The SM alerted an unrelated home member (UHM) and the MGA. The MGA sought assistance from police outside of the home. Police administered CPR to the SC for an unknown period of time and the SC was then transported to an area hospital.

#### **Executive Summary**

The 1-month-old male subject child (SC) died on 3/30/18 while bedsharing with his SM. The ME ruled that the SC's cause of death was bronchiolitis and interstitial pneumonia of viral etiology (human metapneumovirus and rhinovirus/enterovirus). The manner of death was Natural.

According to the case records, at approximately 5:30 AM on 3/30/18, the SM fed the SC and put him on her chest to sleep while lying on the bed. The SM also fell asleep with the SC still on her chest. At about 11:00 AM, the SM awoke and found the SC next to her unresponsive in the bed. An unrelated home member (UHM) called 911. EMT arrived and performed CPR on the SC and throughout transport to the hospital. The ER staff made several attempts to revive the SC but all efforts failed. At 5:59 PM, the ER staff pronounced the SC deceased.

The SC did not have any surviving sibling. The BF did not reside with the family; however, he was involved with the SC. An unrelated home member (UHM) resided in the home with the family.

On 3/30/18, ACS initiated the CPS investigation by contacting the LE staff, ER Dr. and then visited the family to obtain information regarding the fatality. The information obtained by ACS did not reveal the SM was negligent regarding the SC's death.

During the investigation, ACS provided the SM with information regarding bereavement counseling services. Also, the SM received support from her family. The BF declined an interview and did not want contact from ACS.

On 8/30/18, ACS determined the SM was not negligent regarding her son's death and unsubstantiated the allegations of the report. ACS based its decision on the ME's report which indicated the SC's cause of death was bronchiolitis and interstitial pneumonia of viral etiology (human metapneumovirus and rhinovirus/enterovirus). The manner of death was natural.

## Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

**Safety Assessment:** 



• Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

Yes

#### **Determination:**

• Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?

Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory Yes

or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.

#### **Explain:**

ACS did not discuss safe sleep education with the SM. Also, ACS did not contact the pediatrician.

#### **Required Actions Related to the Fatality**

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

	<u> </u>			
Issue:	Failure to provide safe sleep education/information			
Summary:	ACS did not discuss safe sleep education with the SM. ACS observed an unutilized crib in the home. The SM also admitted to co-sleeping with the SC at times and on the night of the incident.			
Legal Reference:	13-OCFS-ADM-02			
Action:	ACS must submit a performance improvement plan within 45 days that identifies the action the agency will take or has taken to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.			
Issue:	Overall Completeness and Adequacy of Investigation			
Summary:	ACS did not contact the pediatrician.			
Legal Reference:	SSL 424.6; 18 NYCRR 432.2(b)(3) and 18 NYCRR 432.2 (b)(3)(iii)(c)			
Action:	ACS must submit a performance improvement plan within 45 days that identifies the action the agency will take or has taken to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.			

### **Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities**

**Incident Information** 



County where fatality inc	ident occurred:	Kings
Was 911 or local emergen	cy number called?	Yes
Time of Call:		12:30 PM
Did EMS respond to the s	scene?	Yes
At time of incident leadin	No	
Child's activity at time of	incident:	
	Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
Playing	☐ Eating	Unknown
Other		
Did child have supervisio	n at time of incident leading to death? Yes	
Is the caretaker listed in t	the Household Composition? Yes - Caregiver 1	

Total number of deaths at incident event:

At time of incident supervisor was: Not impaired.

Children ages 0-18: 1

Adults: 0

#### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	No Role	Female	49 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	32 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Unrelated Home Member	No Role	Female	61 Year(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

On 3/30/18, ACS contacted the LE staff, ER Dr. and then visited the hospital. The LE staff and the ER Dr. stated there was no trauma to the SC and there were no concerns of criminal culpability pending further investigation. The LE staff had visited the family's home and stated the home had the necessary provisions to care for the SC. ACS staff observed the SC at the hospital with no outward signs of trauma.

Following the contact with the LE and ER Dr., ACS visited the family at the case address. The SM was too distraught to speak with ACS. The UHM stated she attempted CPR on the SC and then ran downstairs to alert the MGA who resides in the same building for help. The UHM contacted 911 while the MGA sought assistance from the NYPD out-post located in the neighborhood. NYPD responded to the home and gave the SC CPR until EMS arrived. The FDNY arrived first then EMS. They attempted to revive the SC in the home and while in the ambulance to the hospital. The UHM and the MGA did not have any concerns regarding the SM's care of the SC.

ACS documented the home had sufficient provisions for the SC; however, there were numerous items in the SC's crib which indicated it was not utilized.

NY-18-030 FINAL Page 5 of 9



On 4/1/18, ACS made a follow-up visit to the home. The SM stated she last the SC alive at about 7:00 AM when she laid the SC on her stomach/chest for him to go to sleep. When she woke up, she found the SC was next to her and unresponsive. The SM was unable to provide the timeframe and details of the incident. The MGA stated the SC did not have any medical condition. The SC was medically seen two weeks prior to his passing.

On 4/2/18, the ER Dr. stated at 12:05 PM, the SC arrived at the hospital unconscious via EMS. According to the Dr., full CPR was in progress at the time. The ER staff made many attempts to stabilize the SC and possibly transfer him to another hospital for a higher level of care; however, the SC was not stable. The Dr. stated there were no obvious sign of trauma, marks or bruises on the SC. The Dr. denied the SM appeared to be under any illicit influences at the time.

On 4/4/18, ACS interviewed the SM at the case address. She provided an account of the incident which was consistent with her bed-sharing with the SC. She stated at about 7:00 AM, she gave the SC his pacifier to soothe him and the SC was still on her chest at the time. At 11:00 AM, she awoke and found the SC in bed unresponsive. She reported that the SC was congested two days prior. She took the SC's temperature and it appeared normal. As a result, she did not seek medical attention for the SC. The SM stated the SC did not sleep in his crib on the night of the incident and that he never liked to sleep in the crib. The case records did not reflect ACS discussed safe sleep with the SM. ACS provided the SM with information regarding bereavement counseling services.

On 4/10/18, ACS contacted the UHM. The UHM did not provide any new information regarding the incident. She described the SM as a first-time mother who was very protective of the SC. She did not report any concerns about the care the SM provided the SM.

Also on 4/10/18, the BF declined an interview by ACS. He stated the SM did her best to care for the SC and he did not have any issues with the care the SM gave to the SC. The BF stated he did not want any further contact from ACS.

On 4/13/18, ACS visited the SM who stated she began bereavement counseling services. She had also been coping with her loss by spending time with her family daily on a daily basis.

On 8/30/18, ACS unsubstantiated the allegations of the report against the SM and unfounded and closed the case with no services required.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Natural

Primary Cause of Death: From a medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### **Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review**

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

**Comments:** New York City does not have an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team in the New York City region.

SCR Fatalit	y Report	Summary
-------------	----------	---------

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	<b>Allegation Outcome</b>
integed victim(s)	integed i el petrator (s)	i incaution(s)	Timesation outcome

NY-18-030 FINAL Page 6 of 9



047571 - Deceased Child, Male,	047572 - Mother, Female, 32 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
047571 - Deceased Child, Male,	047572 - Mother, Female, 32 Year(s)	Internal Injuries	Unsubstantiated
047571 - Deceased Child, Male,	047572 - Mother, Female, 32 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

#### **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?				
When appropriate, children were interviewed?				
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?				
Contact with source?	$\boxtimes$			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?				
Pediatrician				
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	$\boxtimes$			

## **Fatality Safety Assessment Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?				

#### **Legal Activity Related to the Fatality**

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

#### Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	1 Ittorod	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							

NY-18-030 FINAL Page 7 of 9

Eco	onomic s	sunnort
	NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services

Economic support			$\boxtimes$	
Funeral arrangements			$\boxtimes$	
Housing assistance			$\boxtimes$	
Mental health services			$\boxtimes$	
Foster care			$\boxtimes$	
Health care			$\boxtimes$	
Legal services			$\boxtimes$	
Family planning			$\boxtimes$	
Homemaking Services			$\boxtimes$	
Parenting Skills			$\boxtimes$	
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>			$\boxtimes$	
Early Intervention			$\boxtimes$	
Alcohol/Substance abuse			$\boxtimes$	
Child Care			$\boxtimes$	
Intensive case management			$\boxtimes$	
Family or others as safety resources				
Other				

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? N/A

## **Explain:**

There are no surviving siblings.

History Prior to the Fatality							
Child Information							
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?	No						
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?	No						
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?	No						
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this chil	ld's death? N/A						
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	No						
Infants Under One Year Old							
During pregnancy, mother:							
Had medical complications / infections	Had heavy alcohol use						
Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs	Smoked tobacco						
Experienced domestic violence	Used illicit drugs						
Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed							

NY-18-030 FINAL Page 8 of 9



Infant was born:  ☐ Drug exposed  ☐ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome				
CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality					
There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the	ne fatality.				
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality					
There is no CPS investigative history more than three years prior to the fat-	ality.				
Legal History Within Three Years Prior t	to the Fatality				
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality inv					
Recommended Action(s)					
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative o					